



Norwegian University of Life Sciences
Faculty of Social Sciences
Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric

2015

ISSN 2464-1472

Report nr. 4

Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan

Workshop/seminar: 'Understanding Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Swat, Pakistan: Implications for Policy and Practice', 2014.

Prepared by: Ingrid Nyborg and Ingvild Jacobsen



The Department of International Environment and Development Studies is part of the Faculty of Social Sciences, Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU). The Department's activities include research, education and assignments.

This report is part of a report series titled 'Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan'. The report series includes reports from workshops and seminars that have taken place during the 4-year research project *Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan: Policy Implications for Local, Gendered Perceptions of Security and Development*.

The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this publication are those of the author and cannot be attributed directly to the Department of International Environment and Development Studies or the Norwegian University of Life Sciences.



**The Research Council
of Norway**

Ingrid Nyborg and Ingvild Jacobsen.

Report from workshop/seminar 'Understanding Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Swat, Pakistan: Implications for Policy and Practice', 2014.

Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric
Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU)

P.O. Box 5003

N-1432 Aas Norway

<http://www.nmbu.no/en/about-nmbu/faculties/samvit/departments/noragric>

ISSN 2464-1472

Photo (cover): Abda Khalid. Swat Valley, 2014. View on Bishigram Banda, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

Cover design: Linn Jäckle/NMBU

Workshop/Seminar

‘Understanding Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Swat, Pakistan: Implications for Policy and Practice’

Friday August 15th 2014, 8:30-13:30

Venue: Litteraturhuset, Oslo

August 2015

Report nr. 4 in the report series: Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan

Prepared by:

Ingrid Nyborg and Ingvild Jacobsen

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Program	3
Welcome and opening remarks	4
Introduction to the workshop, project and project area	5
Summary of the main findings of the research project	8
Project presentations by the project team	10
Research Competence and Capacity Building	13
Panel discussion	15
Final remarks, final comments and vote of thanks	16



Photo: Ingvild Jacobsen. Swat, Pakistan

Introduction

Workshop/Seminar on ‘Understanding Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Swat, Pakistan: Implications for Policy and Practice’.

Post-conflict development is ridden with complexity, and often compounded by additional crises in the form of natural disasters and continued political turmoil. The impacts of these crises on the population can be very uneven, making effective transitions from military to civil security, and humanitarian to development assistance difficult to achieve in practice. In such scenarios, a plethora of local, national and international actors scramble to assist, often representing very different perspectives on what the security and development needs in fact are. The most vital, but indeed the most difficult perspectives to consider are those of the women, men and children who are directly affected by these crises, as access to these areas is often highly restricted for security and practical reasons. To what extent would a better understanding of the experiences of these women, men and children lead to improved security and development policy and practice by national and international actors engaged in post-conflict development? We invited academics, policymakers, and

others interested in Pakistan, gender, human security and development to a one-day seminar to explore this question.

The seminar presented key findings from the three-year research program focusing on the post-conflict case of the Swat Valley in northwestern Pakistan were presented. Taking a broad human security perspective, the research has studied post-crisis development in Swat with particular attention to uncovering women and men's different experiences and understandings of insecurity, vulnerability, and development, analyzing how these relate to security and development discourses, policies and practice in post-conflict situations.



Photo: Ingvild Jacobsen. Swat, Pakistan

Program

8:30-8:55 Coffee

9:00 Welcome by, Dr. Mari Sundli Tveit, Rector, Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU)

9:10 Opening remarks, Dr. S. M. Junaid Zaidi Rector, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology (CIIT), Pakistan

9:25 Introduction to the workshop, project and project area
Dr. Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric, NMBU and Dr. Bahadar Nawab, CIIT Abbottabad,

9:45 Summary of the main findings of the research project
Project Team

10:00 Questions and discussion

10:15 Coffee/Tea Break

10:30 Project presentations (including questions and short break)
Project Team

11:55 Panel: Reflections by
Kaja Borchgrevink, PRIO/Noragric (Chair of the session)
MFA: Jannicke Jæger, Senior Adviser Section for Humanitarian Affairs;
Norad: Dr. Anne Wetlesen, Senior Adviser Section for Research, Innovation and Higher Education
Norwegian Church Aid: Thora Holter, Senior Adviser Gender Justice

12:25 Questions/discussion

12:35 Final remarks, Prof. Dr Khan Gul Jadoon, Director, CIIT Abbottabad

12:45 Final comments, Dr. Poul Wisborg, Head of Department, Noragric, NMBU

12:55 Vote of thanks by project team

13:00 – 13:30 Lunch

(13:30 – 15:00 Seminar on 'Skiing for Peace: Working with youth in post-conflict Swat')

As a part of the seminar, a photo exhibition was arranged with photos from Swat by professional photographer Ken Opprann. Posters with photos from some of the researchers' fieldwork and posters with photos from the Ski School in Malam Jabba, Swat were also exhibited.

Welcome and opening remarks

The seminar started with a welcome by Dr. Mari Sundli Tveit, Rector, Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU). She gave her appreciation to Dr. Bahadar Nawab and the delegation from Pakistan for coming to Norway and NMBU, and gave her thanks to Ingrid Nyborg. During her welcome speech Dr. Sundli Tveit stressed the importance of NMBU's international collaboration with universities, organizations and research institutes and the role this collaboration plays in capacity building in several countries. She appreciated this collaboration with Pakistan and the important role of the NORGLOBAL program. Furthermore, the importance of this seminar for NMBU, Noragric and other institutions at NMBU was highlighted. The collaboration with CIIT, with the Master of Science Program on Sustainable Water, Sanitation, Health and Development, is an example of one of the projects with great success. Dr. Sundli Tveit ended her session by welcoming further collaboration between CIIT and NMBU.

The opening remarks were given by Dr. S. M. Junaid Zaidi, Rector, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology (CIIT) in Pakistan. Dr. Junaid Zaidi started with acknowledging the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Norad for support and guidance. He gave his thanks to NORGLOBAL for supporting this important project and gave his appreciation to the government of Norway's support to Pakistan. Since COMSATS was established in 2000, Pakistan has been fighting war and terrorism, nonetheless, Dr. Zaidi stressed, development is happening in the country and people are continuing with their lives. Dr. Zaidi gave a presentation of COMSATS and highlighted that not only do they provide research and education, but also contribute to the development of the country. He highlighted the importance of increasing the scope of social sciences at CIIT and the significant role the university plays in development and social responsibility for the communities. Dr. Zaidi ended his session with a wish to further expand this collaboration and support.

An introduction to the workshop, the project and the project area was then given by the project leaders Dr. Ingrid Nyborg, NMBU and Dr. Bahadar Nawab, CIIT Abbottabad, followed by summary of the main findings of the research project.

Introduction to the workshop, project and project area

Dr. Ingrid Nyborg started with a presentation of the institutional collaboration between the Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric, Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU), Department of Development Studies, COMSATS University (CIIT), Abbottabad, Pakistan and Holistic Understanding for Justified Research and Action HUIRA (Swat NGO). Persons involved in the project from NMBU include Ingrid Nyborg, Project Leader; Ingvild Jacobsen, PhD fellow; Kashif Khan, PhD and Helena Svele, Research Assistant. From CIIT: Bahadar Nawab, Project Leader; Abda Khalid, PhD Fellow (NMBU/CIIT), Noor Elahi, PhD Fellow (NMBU/CIIT); Faheema Taj Khan, Researcher/Research Coordinator (NMBU/CIIT); Hamayun Khan, Researcher (CIIT) and Rida Zainab, Researcher (CIIT). From the NGO HUIRA: Saleem Ahmad, Executive Director, and field assistants from the organization.

Dr. Ingrid Nyborg continued the session with a presentation of the project's main objective and research questions. The main objective of this project has been:

To explore, using the concept of human security, how women and men's local experiences and understandings of insecurity, vulnerability and development relate to security and development discourses, policies and programs in post-conflict (post-crisis) situations.

Research questions addressed in the project:

- To explore how women, men and communities experience and cope with different kinds of insecurity (i.e. food, environmental, political, and personal) as they pursue their livelihoods in post-conflict contexts.
- How do they perceive the role of state (government officials, local police, military) and non-state institutions (village leadership, religious leaders, civil society groups, local and international NGOs) in contributing to, preventing or mitigating different types of conflicts?
- How do state and non-state institutions perceive their roles and responsibilities in securing women and men in local communities?

- What implications does a local understanding of human security have for security and development discourses, programs and policies?

Dr. Ingrid Nyborg then proceeded with a presentation of the following key/contested concepts of highly relevance in this project: Security, human security, post-conflict/conflict, development and gender. She raised questions regarding whose security is addressed; is it state or individual security? Military or civil police? Enforcement, physical protection, protection of rights? Gender as a category or as a set of powered relations? Each of these are contested concepts, and the way we define them will determine how we frame our research. She highlighted the concept of human security with a focus on the security of people, rather than only states. Human security is used as broad framework for this research because it links security and development in a way that can uncover multiple insecurities including economic, food, health, environmental, personal, community and political, and how they may be interlinked. The discussion was brought towards the concepts of conflict/post-conflict and how can conflict be defined. This research project considers conflict as a regular aspect of human relations that is always present in some form, and attempts to describe different forms of conflict in different contexts, for different people. The term post-conflict can be mis-leading. In this context, post-conflict is usually referring to post-military operation, because obviously there is still conflict in many forms in the Swat Valley.

The next concept presented was development. In this project, development is viewed as a broad concept. She addressed the following pertinent questions: What kind of development? Economic? Political? Increased well-being? Human rights? Social change? Poverty reduction? Who defines what development is? When considering humanitarian aid and longer-term development – how do they differ? The final concept presented was gender and Dr. Ingrid Nyborg explained that in this project gender is defined as a social construction where power relations exist between women and men, and between women and between men. She highlighted the importance of not only focusing on women; men and masculinities are part of gender, for example when considering the masculinities of men as police and the role *Pakhtunwali* plays in society. The project has focused particularly on the

diversity of women and men's experiences in a post-conflict setting (e.g. intersects with class, ethnicity, livelihoods etc).

Some of the central questions addressed in this research have been how security and development issues impact different women and different men differently. And how gender relations influence the way in which we think about, define and act on security and development issues. Due to broad definitions of human security and development, extensive data on most aspects of people's lives were collected. Through lenses of gender and human security, the project has looked at how history/culture, government and local institutions, migration/displacement, food security and health, livelihoods and resource conflicts, and decision making might be interlinked.

After the presentation of the overall framework, Dr. Ingrid Nyborg presented the methodology of the project. Qualitative methods with questions guides were used. Six villages in lowland, middle and upper Swat with different degrees of conflict/impact of flood were chosen. Focus groups, interviews with key informants, life histories and participant observation were the main tools for data collection with an important focus on difference (e.g. gender, class, livelihoods). Data collection was not an easy task in this area. Despite well-planned field visits, researchers were regularly faced with security challenges and took a degree of risk in moving around in the villages. Establishing trust was critical, both to ensure the researchers' safety, and to obtain reliable data.

Dr. Bahadar Nawab gave an introduction to the study area: Swat, in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province, northwest in Pakistan. He explained that Swat is famous for the landscape, tall mountains, pleasant weather, trout fish and even a ski resort. The area has a unique historical background as it was a princely state with a separate constitution. It merged with Pakistan in 1969, and went through a political shift and changes in formal institutions that created confusion and frustration. He then proceeded with a brief overview of the crisis (conflict & flood) in Swat:

- Talibanization which can be rooted back to 1990's under the umbrella of Tehreek Nafaz Shariat e Mohammad
- In 2002 the militants came up full-force and demanded Shariat law in Swat.
- In 2008 the government conducted a military operation against the militants.

- Flood in 2010, close to 20 million people were affected and huge infrastructure loss.

He ended his presentation by emphasising the importance of awareness and knowledge of the diversity within the area when it comes to religion, ethnic groups, gender, and practices of Pakthoonwali. He concluded his presentation by stressing that this study has analyzed Swat from different angles and dimensions in the wake of crisis.

Summary of the main findings of the research project

In the following session Dr. Ingrid Nyborg and Dr. Bahadar Nawab presented a summary of the main findings of the research project under four headings:

- 1) Understanding complexity and diversity,
- 2) Power in aid-international aspects,
- 3) Power and politics-national aspects, and
- 4) Renegotiation of institutional roles and relationships.

Throughout the research, it became clear that there is a lack of understanding of complexity and diversity, and poor understandings and definitions of not only who the effected and vulnerable are in a crisis, but also how and why they are affected and vulnerable. It is therefore important to investigate why some are more vulnerable, whether it is because of unequal power relations, gender relations, institutional or structural relations or political relations. Our findings show that this lack of understanding has resulted in not only ineffective responses, but also increases in social, economic and gender inequality, as well as conflict. They continued the presentation with a discussion of dilemmas regarding post-crisis compensation, reconstruction and livelihood support and emphasized the importance of coordination between the government, the international community and local organizations. Questioning who were the most affected in these cases uncovered a complexity that both the government and the organizations were ill equipped to address.

The next aspect presented was power and international aid, where they argued that international coordination of response i.e. where the UN has for example formed clusters, has had both positive and negative impacts on the effectiveness of post-crisis assistance in

Swat. It has uncovered weaknesses in government departments, as well as the tensions between government line ministries and the newly formed government bodies. This has made it clearer where institutional support would be helpful. Women's issues have become more visible in the area, but this research has also uncovered the lack of competence of the international community (IC) to understand how gendered relations can be improved in the context of Swat. Furthermore, it has not contributed to good relations between the government and the IC. Sometimes the government is included in processes, other times they either are left out or disengage. Part of the difficulty is the high turnover in international staff and lack of relationship and trust-building, and the lack of trust in government processes. Most critical, there is a weakening of the influence of local development organizations in defining and implementing appropriate responses. Processes are often dictated by the internal community and subcontracted locally for implementation. Local organizations have trouble competing for contracts on their own terms and face tough competition from more internationally linked organizations. The international community has little trust in the competence of local organizations, but rather than choosing to support a process of institution building, it often focusses on 'getting the job done' in the short term.

The presentation continued with a discussion of power and politics and highlighted the following questions: What types of power and politics are there? How do the national bodies operate during and after the crises? How are they organized? Who decides what interventions should be made and where? The presenters highlighted the importance of coordination and priorities of national and provincial governments and the coordination between civil and military government's interventions. Furthermore, they addressed the need of strengthening the capacity and capability of government lines departments and an emphasis on selection criteria and accessibility

Dr Bahadar Nawab continued the presentation with a discussion of renegotiation of institutional roles and relationships. He examined the three major disasters: the earthquake in 2005, The Swat IDP's in 2009 and the flood in 2010. These disasters exposed loopholes in institutional, managerial, financial and technical issues. Furthermore, the disasters exposed research gaps in the relief, rehabilitation, reconstruction and development efforts of government, donors, humanitarian agencies I(NGOs) and

politicians. He presented the different forms of institutional set ups for the efforts that took place after the three disasters.

The presentation ended with the following implications for policy/practice: The project has uncovered weaknesses in response, with not enough attention to the questions of 'In what ways?' and 'Why?' are people affected. This complexity is important to understand so that assistance does not only help, but also 'does no harm'. It is necessary with a better analysis of the complex processes that lead to vulnerability for different people. Therefore, a broader response design based on a concern with human security, where different crises are integrated and the effects are seen as complex and interconnected would better capture the situation. There is a need for more integrated combination of strategies for relief, development, where analyzing unintended or unanticipated consequences are a part of the process. The newly established disaster management authorities and line departments need strengthening and clear mandates. The interventions are often not target-oriented and the ones most affected are not reached, this might be done through the restructuring and re-mandating of the cluster approach. There is a need for capacity building in line departments, local organizations and institutions, and re-examination of the processes that link the IC to government and local organizations, including a focus on trust building between the IC and government. Furthermore, focus on institutional capacity building of locally-based organizations, including gendered aspects, is important. This could result in a much better chance of understanding and incorporating contextual issues in assistance.

Project presentations by the project team

Dr Ingrid Nyborg introduced the next session where the researchers in the project presented their projects and some of the main findings.

Faheema Taj Khan and Humayun Khan gave the first presentation titled "Gendered perspectives on the experiences of conflict and human insecurity in Swat" with examples from the field. They highlighted the diversity in experiences of the different phases during conflict, operation, displacement, return and rehabilitation, and disaster and the need to

include aspects of gender, socio-economic groups, location and caste in the analysis. Generalizations about men and women's issues not only leave their key concerns masked but also unaddressed. Among the policy implications given were: psychosocial programs for both adult men and women can help in their proper rehabilitation. Health care facilities including maternal and pre-natal care has to be extended in remote areas and camp conditions need to be improved in all aspects. Camps have to be set-up according to the culture and specific needs of women and men. The design of targeted projects addressing particular needs of these men and women's of different locations, caste and socioeconomic group can help in translation of human security into practice.

Abda Khalid and Ingvild Jacobsen gave the next presentation titled: "How Crisis (Conflict and Flood) affects Gendered Structures and Roles in the Society". The focus was especially on women's experiences during and after crisis regarding security and insecurity, livelihood and access to land. They argued for a move away from dominant narratives of women in conflict as solely victims and towards an understanding of the complexities and diversity regarding different women's experiences. They gave a brief introduction to the issue of women and conflict on the international development and security agenda before moving on to presenting some findings from their fieldwork. The presentation ended with the following challenges and implications for policymaking and development organizations: There is a need for bottom-up approaches to grasp the diversity and complexity of women's experiences and needs in a post-crisis situation, and an awareness towards the local context is crucial. Furthermore, it is necessary with strong commitment and increased resources to programs and activities addressing gender issues.

Noor Elahi and Dr Bahadar Nawab gave the third presentation titled "Participatory development practices. A critical assessment of their impacts on gender empowerment and development in pre and post crisis Swat, Pakistan". The objectives of the research were to analyze how participatory development practices contributed to development, humanitarian aid, gender empowerment and social changes in pre and post crisis Swat. The study showed that there were hundreds of humanitarian agencies and millions of dollars in funds provided, but there was no proper plan for enabling widespread participation of the affected men and women. The development process, particularly in post-crisis Swat,

remained unsuccessful in achieving targets of gender empowerment and development in comparison with pre-crisis development activities. The development process was mainly based on interventions focusing on individuals instead of broader participatory development. Expectations among some of the poor and middle class families were not met. Furthermore, there were difficulties in implementing participatory development practices during relief and rehabilitation, as there was still a large degree of mistrust and fear between all of the actors. The presentation ended with the following recommendations on how gender empowerment and development objectives can be achieved through participatory development after immediate end of crisis: In the reconstruction phase, participatory development considering the needs of a wider, diverse group of beneficiaries must be prioritized rather than a focus on individual development activities. There is a need of strengthening formal and informal institutions and improved coordination between government, NGO's and donors. Finally, consideration of local social, cultural and political aspects is necessary, and this can only be achieved through broader participation of both women and men of different socio-economic and cultural backgrounds.

The forth presentation was given by the project leaders Dr. Ingrid Nyborg and Dr. Bahadar Nawab titled "Human security, civil security and local institutions". The framework of institutional bricolage was presented with the police, army, jirga, courts, local police, defense committees, special forces and legal advisors as different institutions relevant when it comes to conflict management, conflict resolution, rights protection, peacebuilding, women's rights and resource access. In such a complicated institutional scenario, questions on their changing relationships emerge. Are there examples of changes in the relationship between the police and the communities? Are local institutions given room to re-negotiate with government? There are often attempts to find universal solutions and a blue print to use in addressing security and justice issues in what are very diverse contexts. The research addressed some aspects of confusion and dilemmas arising during conflict regarding the roles and responsibilities of the police, the army and the Jirga and the communication and coordination between these. The research found that there are several local attempts to deal with these issues, with the army, militants, communities and police exploring innovative ways to collaborate to ensure more trust and collaboration; however,

this has not been visible to international community and thus not given neither attention nor the support it could have. Transition in institutions that has taken place and the following aspects were highlighted: the police are back in action from self-defense to civil security, but investigation and response is still weak and training is sorely needed in how to better support their ability to protect both men and women in the communities. There is a reserve force for police and women police based in the communities, and community-police relations are improving, exemplified by the formation of police-community committees who meet regularly to discuss specific cases. The presentation ended with the following conclusion and policy implications: there is need to highlight the importance of women policing, of strengthening police-community relations, improving the coordination between police and armed forces and increased acceptance of each other's roles and responsibilities. Furthermore, it is necessary to prioritize human rights and eliminate its violation by the security agencies, and to redefine state security in terms of human security and move from a police state to community-based policing.

Research Competence and Capacity Building

As a part of the Norwegian Research Council's NORGLOBAL program, the project had as an important aim to support research competence-building in the South. The workshop therefore also included a presentation and discussion of the ways in which this research has impacted research competence and capacity at CIIT, as well as wider development in the area.

Research competence and capacity building, a presentation of how this project has contributed to competence and capacity building for Noragric, CIIT and HUIRA. Dr. Ingrid Nyborg explained that for Noragric the collaboration contributed to field access to difficult post-conflict areas and the experience of learning in joint research teams during the project. The project has led to good research processes with partners and inspired new ideas for further research in human security.

Dr. Bahadar Nawab presented how the project has supported research competence and capacity building at CIIT. He explained that the project has increased competence of CIIT in research, education and policy support in at least five ways:

1) It has provided technical and research support in areas related to humanitarian aid, post disaster development, livelihoods, human security, gender and community policing. These are issues that need increasing attention in research, and CIIT is now able to contribute to both research and policy debates in the country based on the research support in these areas.

2) It has supported the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan's policy of strengthening the social sciences in general and developing curricula in peace and conflict, and gender in particular.

3) This research has specifically led to the establishment of an MS program in Peace, Conflict and Development and PhD in Development Studies jointly with Sri Lanka, Nepal and NMBU (NORHED).

4) A new culture of research and research-based teaching has been developed at CIIT as a result of this project. The students are now not only getting theoretical knowledge in the class but they have frequent exposure to real life problem in the field and in post crises scenario.

5) The research has had a significant influence on education, research and development processes in Pakistan. The project has led to improved skills in action research and institutional capacity building at CIIT. Among the important aspects related to institutional capacity building were strong research groups and know-how in applied social sciences, good library, laboratories and teaching aids, trained and motivated faculty and students in post-crisis development. The project provided funding for two PhDs, who will join the faculty as experts in these areas. Furthermore, the project has led to strong outreach services in policies, advocacy, emergency response, disaster risk reduction and adaptation to climate change.

Mr. Saleem Ahmad continued the session with a presentation of how the project has helped in research capacity and competence building in the local NGO HUIRA. He explained that the project has led to improved staff research skills and exposure to qualitative methods. It has investigated important topics in a way that was new for the organization

beforehand and it has led to Hujra moving into new areas of work, such as supporting community participation in rule of law reforms, such as the training of para professional legal help for women.



Photo: Ingunn Andersen. Panel Discussion

Panel discussion

The last session of the seminar was a panel discussion of the implications of this research to development policy and practice with representatives from the government and NGO community. The panel was chaired by Kaja Borchgrevink, PRIO/Noragric and reflections were given by Jannicke Jæger, Senior Adviser Section for Humanitarian Affairs, MFA; Dr. Anne Wetlesen, Senior Adviser Section for Research, Innovation and Higher Education, Norad; Thora Holter, Senior adviser Gender Justice, Norwegian Church Aid (NCA); and Mr. Ibrar Hussein Khan, Head of Chancery, Embassy of Pakistan, Oslo, who participated mainly in his personal capacity as a native of the Swat Valley. The following aspects were addressed during the panel discussion: This research has shown the importance of including local organizations and knowledge of the diversity in our understanding of the

needs of communities in post-crisis situations, something that is critical in our responses to humanitarian crises. It has also demonstrated very clearly the importance of supporting education and research in developing countries and how such support and the results from academic research can be provided to society and communities in such a way as to contribute to more informed development processes. The results from this project must continue to be published as it will be interesting not only for Swat, but also to other areas of Pakistan and to other countries that are experiencing conflict and post conflict situations as well. The question of how to make the best use of the research results were raised. The importance of social science to gain knowledge about conflict and post-conflict situations was stressed. Furthermore, increased collaboration between organizations and researchers, investment in long term research and studies, and bottom-up approaches that include local governments are crucial. NCA reported that they as an organization take seriously the need to link with researchers to understand the complexity of the contexts with which they work, such that they can improve their approaches to development. They are already in touch with Noragric and CIIT in Pakistan precisely to find way to collaborate in practice.

Final remarks, final comments and vote of thanks

Final remarks were given by Professor Dr Khan Gul Jadoon, Director of CIIT Abbottabad, who stressed the importance of this project both for CIIT and for research and development in Pakistan. He expressed his gratitude to the rector and NMBU for the hospitality and collaboration during this visit as well as through projects over the years and hopes that CIIT will continue to receive this support and help. Furthermore, he expressed his gratitude to rector at CIIT for sparing time to be part of this visit. Special thanks was given to Ingrid for all arrangements, hospitality and care. Dr. Jadoon continued his remarks by giving his thanks to all that helped completing this project, especially to Norad, MFA and NORGLOBAL, and for all the support given by the Pakistani Embassy. It has been a great contribution to Pakistan. He highlighted the importance of the Development Study Department at CIIT, which has strong national and international exposure. Dr. Jadoon stressed the importance of being open to society and the valuable social work done by CIIT.

He appreciated all efforts given by The Norwegian Government, the Norwegian Research Council, Norad, Noragric, the Norwegian Church Aid and everybody present. He ended his remarks by saying that this project has given a solid base and increased opportunities at both universities and he hopes to continue this good collaboration and capacity building of his institutions as well as his country. Final comments were given by Dr. Poul Wisborg, Head of Department at Noragric, NMBU, who appreciated the long-term collaboration Noragric has had with CIIT, and his wish that this collaboration continue for many years to come, contributing important education and research results to improve the lives of people. He gave his thanks to the teams for sharing their findings from their research during this seminar, and gave his thanks to the panellists for providing important perspectives. Dr. Wisborg commented on important lessons and implications of this project where he highlighted the importance of local level perspectives, the importance of visibility, dignity and accountability, seeing the individuals affected by crisis and their involvement. He stressed the acknowledgment of diversity of people and the diversity of experiences. He highlighted the importance of gender and a perspective that in a patriarchal context also include women's opportunities. Dr. Wisborg ended his comments by giving thanks to the teams, the people working together, the panel, COMSATS, the important collaboration with HUIRA, staff and PhD candidates, the Embassy of Pakistan, the Government of Norway, Norad, the Norwegian research Council and the Norwegian Church Aid. He expressed his hopes of continuing this collaboration and to continue to be involved in this kind of research.

The workshop ended with a vote of thanks by the project leader Dr. Ingrid Nyborg, to all who had contributed to both this workshop, and the research program over the last four years. A special thanks was given to the Research Council of Norway, who funded the project through the NORGLOBAL program.