

Norwegian University of Life Sciences Faculty of Social Sciences Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric

**2015**ISSN 2464-1472

Report nr. 2

# Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan

Workshop/seminar: 'Gendered Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in Pakistan', 2012.

Prepared by: Helena Svele, Ingvild Jacobsen, Kashif Khan and Ingrid Nyborg



The Department of International Environment and Development Studies is part of the Faculty of Social Sciences, Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU). The Department's activities include research, education and assignments.

This report is part of a report series titled 'Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan'. The report series includes reports from workshops and seminars that have taken place during the 4-year research project Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan: Policy Implications for Local, Gendered Perceptions of Security and Development.

The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this publication are those of the author and cannot be attributed directly to the Department of International Environment and Development Studies or the Norwegian University of Life Sciences.









Helena Svele, Ingvild Jacobsen, Kashif Khan and Ingrid Nyborg.

Report from workshop/seminar 'Gendered Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in Pakistan', 2012.

Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric

Norwegian University of Life Sciences (NMBU)

P.O. Box 5003

N-1432 Aas Norway

http://www.nmbu.no/en/about-nmbu/faculties/samvit/departments/noragric

ISSN 2464-1472

Photo (cover): Abda Khalid. Two Pukhtoon women during a bee keeping training (organised by a local

organisation HURJA) in Upper SWAT. Pakistan, 2013.

Cover design: Linn Jäckle/NMBU

## Workshop/Seminar

## 'Gendered Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in Pakistan'

Friday June 5<sup>th</sup> 2012 Venue: Department of International Environment and Development studies, Noragric, Norwegian University of Life Science (NMBU), Ås, Norway

## August 2015

Report nr. 2 in the report series: Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Conflict Pakistan

Prepared by:

Helena Svele, Ingvild Jacobsen, Kashif Khan and Ingrid Nyborg

## **Table of Contents**

Introduction	1
Workshop on Gendered Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Crisis Developme in Pakistan	
Program	2
Welcome note by Gry Synnevåg, Head of Department at Noragric	3
Background for the workshop and introduction of participants	3
Conceptualizing Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Crisis Contexts: Choices in definitions and approaches – Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric	3
The case of Pakistan	7
Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in North Western Pakistan – Kashif Khan, PhD Fellow, Noragric	7
Development Aid in Post-Crisis Swat: Local Perspectives – Saleem Ahmad, Execution Director, HUJRA (local NGO from Swat, Pakistan)	
Discussion led by Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric	9
Gender Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Disaster Development in North Western Pakistan – Bahadar Nawab and Faheema Kalsoom (COMSATS University, Abbottabad, Pakistan)	
Discussion led by Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric	
Gender, Human Security and Development: Reflections from South Sudan – Darley Kjosavik	
Discussion led by Stig Hansen, Noragric	13
Current and Future Research Directions – Ingvild Jacobsen, Abda Khalid, Noor Elahi, Darley Kjosavik, Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric	
Summing up and closing led by Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric	15

#### Introduction

# Workshop on Gendered Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in Pakistan

Human rights and freedoms are being advocated more strongly than ever by the international community, and remain an integral feature of global development discourse. Within this discourse, human security as a concept has gained prominence over the last decade, offering an alternative to a more narrow focus on state sovereignty and security, and linking security to broader development goals. While human security is an important issue in all contexts, threats to human security come more clearly to the fore during post-conflict and natural disaster situations, which pose particular challenges to governments, civil society and the international community.

We invited academics, policymakers, and others interested in Pakistan, gender, human security and development to a one-day seminar at the Norwegian University of Life Sciences (UMB) to discuss these issues. The workshop explored post-crisis development in north-western Pakistan from a human security perspective, with particular attention to women and men's different perspectives and experiences of insecurity and vulnerability. Researchers from Norway and Pakistan discussed their on-going research on how gender is perceived by different actors, and how it influences our understandings of security and development policy and practice. We also included a presentation and discussion on similar issues from some of our on-going research on Sudan to allow for comparative reflections. This brief report highlights the presentations and discussions from the workshop, rather than results per se, which will be presented in various forms later in the research process. We appreciate the open, critical and constructive discussions, which have given us both new ideas and inspiration to take with us on the rest of this fascinating journey!

The workshop was organized by the Conflict, Human Security and Development (CHSD) research cluster at The Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric, UMB, in collaboration with our research partners at COMSATS Institute of Information Technology (CIIT), Abbottabad, Pakistan.

Participants: Abda Khalid (Noragric, UMB), Bahadar Nawab (CIIT, Pakistan), Darley Kjosavik (Noragric, UMB), Faheema Kalsoom (CIIT, Pakistan), Gry Synnevåg (Noragric, UMB), Helena Svele (Noragric, UMB), Ingrid Nyborg (Noragric, UMB), Ingvild Jacobsen (Noragric, UMB), Kaja Borchgrevink (PRIO/Noragric, UMB), Karim Merchant (UK), Kashif Khan (Noragric, UMB), Martin Semric (Noragric, UMB), Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam (Noragric, UMB), Noor Elahi (Noragric, UMB), Poul Wisborg (Noragric, UMB), Saleem Ahmad (Hujra, Pakistan), Selina Kohr (Noragric, UMB), Stig Hansen (Noragric, UMB), Åse-Marit Kristiansen (The Research Council of Norway).

#### **Program**

- Coffee/tea
- Welcome note by Gry Synnevåg, Head of Department, Noragric
- Background for the workshop and introduction of participants
- Conceptualizing Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Crisis Contexts: Choices in definitions and approaches Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric
- The Case of Pakistan:
  - Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in north Western Pakistan Kashif Khan, PhD Fellow, Noragric
  - Development Aid in Post-Crisis Swat: Local Perspectives Saleem Ahmad, Executive Director, HUJRA (local NGO from Swat, Pakistan)

Discussant: Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric

- Coffee/tea break
- Gender Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Disaster Development in North Western Pakistan – Bahadar Nawab and Faheema Kalsoom (COMSATS University, Abbottabad Campus, Pakistan)

Discussant: Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric

- Lunch
- Gender, Human Security and Development: Reflections from South Sudan Darley Kjosavik

Open discussion – Chair: Stig Hansen, Noragric

- Current and Future Research Directions Ingvild Jacobsen, Abda Khalid, Noor Elahi, Darley Kjosavik, Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric
- Summing up and closing Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric

#### Welcome note by Gry Synnevåg, Head of Department at Noragric

The workshop was kicked-off by Gry Synnevåg who welcomed the participants from near and far, and argued that UMB has possibly one of the strongest research environments on Pakistan within Norway. In her address she hoped that the workshop will create an enabling environment for researchers and participants to develop a better understanding of human security and development in conflict affected settings. She hoped that as an outcome of the workshop the participants would get to know each other better, strengthening the collaboration and continue networking in the future. The workshop would be a place to present the ongoing stories experienced from working with the topic of discussion. She wished good luck to everyone and was looking forward to interesting discussions and presentations during the workshop.

#### **Background for the workshop and introduction of participants**

Ingrid introduced some of the different themes addressed by various projects within the CHSD cluster at Noragric, such as conflict, crises, gender, human security, human rights, securitization, and development, and referred to the list and description of projects provided to the participants. She explained that whereas the focal point of this workshop would be on Pakistan as a case, the workshop would also include research from South-Sudan, as a way to do a comparative analysis on the issues of gender, human security and post-conflict development. She stressed that the workshop would present the research that is in progress, and not results per se. Discussions will help us get new ideas, and to learn more about what each other is doing. In that sense, the workshop would be informal in nature. She then presented the agenda for the workshop that would start with an explanation of the conceptual framework within which the Pakistan study is placed. This would be followed by presentations of the area of study and data collected from the field, and continue with presentations of research on South-Sudan, and then end with introductions to ongoing and future research projects. The background of the workshop was then followed by a round of presentations of the participants.

## Conceptualizing Gender, Human Security and Development in Post-Crisis Contexts: Choices in definitions and approaches – Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric

Ingrid started this session by giving an introduction about the project and presented the partners involved in the project, including the project leaders, PhD students, and research assistant and research coordinator from the respective universities, UMB and COMSATS, as well as the executive director and research assistant from the locally based NGO in Pakistan, HUJRA. She explained that the project was funded by the Norwegian Research

Council, and is part of the NORGLOBAL program. The main research aim of the project is to explore local perceptions and link them with policies, and in doing so explore more deeply the conceptual terms such as security, human security, conflict, development and gender, whose meanings are highly contested. It is hoped that the knowledge generated through this research will lead to capacity building at several levels: the communities which we do our field research, the local NGO, Hujra, who is our invaluable partner in Swat, as well as organizations, government officials in Swat and Peshawar, and international and national policy makers working in post-crises development, including the Norwegian Embassy with whom we have regular contact. Another aim of the research project is to contribute specifically to longer-term institution building of our university partner, COMSATS University, Abbottabad. Capacity building of PhD students and curriculum development are therefore an important part of the strategy of the project.

She then moved on to explain the main research objective of the project in Pakistan:

To explore, using the concept of human security, how women and men's local experiences and understandings of insecurity, vulnerability and development relate to security and development discourses, policies and programs in post-conflict (post-disaster) situations.

While the focus was initially on post-conflict, it was extended to post-crisis, such as post floods and earthquakes, since unfortunately many crises arose after the fieldwork had started. She explained that in particular, the periods of transitions from military to civilian security, and from humanitarian to development aid are interesting and important to understand through this project. Further, she introduces the research questions;

- How do women, men and communities experience and cope with different kinds of insecurity (i.e. food, environmental, political, economic, health and personal) as they pursue their livelihoods in post-crisis contexts?
- How do they perceive the role of state and non-state institutions in contributing to, preventing or mitigating different types of conflicts/crisis?
- How do state and non-state institutions perceive their roles and responsibilities in securing men and women in local communities?
- What implications does a local understanding of human security have for integrating gender into human security and development discourses, programs and policies?

She explained that we would look at how these perceptions and experiences from various stakeholders are linked. Following the research questions, she went through some of the key contested concepts in the project: security, human security, conflict, post-conflict, development and gender. There are, for example, many ways of seeing security, and one

has to be clear on whether one is talking about state or individual, civilian or military security etc. The project has found human security – encompassing economic, food, health, environmental, personal, community and political security for individuals (approximating the UN definition) as a useful overarching concept. She explained that although the concept is broad, it is nevertheless helpful in linking ideas around security and development and studying the interactions between these in practice. Although the use of a broader definition of security is helpful in some ways, it is also important not to limit the analysis too much by focusing only on threats, which is in some ways a securitization of development issues. One should also consider the insights one can gain by exploring, for example, vulnerabilities. Conflict is another fuzzy concept, and does not necessarily mean war. In Pakistan, there has not been war per se, but rather 'military operations' and widespread use of violence. There are different degrees and experiences of conflict, and approaches to understanding conflict differ as to whether conflict should be resolved or merely managed in a way to avoid violence. This would depend on whether one believes that conflict is something we can rid ourselves of, through, for example, the exercise of force, or something which is in fact a part of our everyday lives which should perhaps be negotiated. By confining conflict to war-like conditions we might miss an understanding of how and why some conflicts might escalate to violence.

Development also has many aspects and definitions. What is important to note is who is defining it and in what ways. In post-conflict contexts, how development is defined and understood could be quite different for humanitarian and development actors. Lastly, gender in our research focuses on women and men, femininities and masculinities, as well as the social construction of the relations between men and women. Gendered power relations and diversity of experiences among men and among women are important aspects to explore in post-crisis contexts: the project will try to discover differences, rather than rely on gendered generalizations. Gender is a crucial concept to explore because it influences as well the way we ourselves reflect, define and act on security and development issues. For example, understanding masculinities is interesting in terms of analyzing the role of the civil police in the area, and understanding the ways in which they might relate differently to the insecurities of women and men in post conflict situations.

Ingrid then moved on to discuss the themes addressed in the question guides used for data collection. Among the themes are; history of village and demographics, local infrastructure and government institutions (schools and health), migration/displacement, wealth and food security, land and water issues/conflicts, livelihoods (agriculture, livestock, income), conflict and security (community police, defense committees), decision-making in the village, social relations in the village, and aid initiatives (humanitarian and development). So far we have discovered interesting links between the themes, and similarities and differences in the villages.

Lastly, the overall methodology of the project was presented. The study relies partially on secondary data which is available from the area (studies, reports etc.), but the main source of data is primary data collected from a total of 6 villages in Swat, Pakistan that have been hit by different forms of crisis. This far the project has covered three villages. The research methods used are mainly qualitative question guides with semi-structured questions. Two types of interviews have been conducted; key informant/individual interviews and focus group interviews (organized according to wealth, gender and land ownership). In addition, life histories have been collected, and participant observation has been employed to the extent possible. During the fieldwork, tools such as wealth ranking, participatory mapping (land use, water resources) and observation have been helpful. Analysis workshops have been held in Swat and Abbottabad, and will continue to be held throughout the project. She gave the example of an analysis workshop held in March 2011 where researchers, students, staff from HUJRA, women and men from three villages and other actors from the community were present to discuss the preliminary data at that time. In order to share the collected data effectively among the researchers there is a common data pool from the main researched villages, and in addition the individual researcher has his or her own data on the particular topic chosen for their study.

After Ingrid's session on conceptual framework and introduction to the project, the floor was ready for sessions regarding the case of Pakistan.



Photo: Helena Svele. Presentation by Dr. Ingrid Nyborg

#### The case of Pakistan

# Human Security and Post-Crisis Development in North Western Pakistan – Kashif Khan, PhD Fellow, Noragric

Kashif continued the workshop focusing on the human (in) securities and continuing conflict in North Western Pakistan from a macro perspective. He explained the reason why he had chosen the area, and the significance of carrying out research on conflict, development and humanitarian interventions, referring to the conflict trap that the region is experiencing with continued military operations and displacement. The Pakistani government has a stated strategy of post-crisis development, namely 3D's; Dialogue, Development and Deterrence. He further explained the geographical significance of North Western Pakistan which consists of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and FATA. It is guite different from other areas in Pakistan ethnically and culturally, and characterized profoundly by its colonial past. Swat is one of the districts within the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province which was extremely affected by the flood in 2010. Both IDPs and Afghan refugees are staying in this province, and there are borders problems as well as regional problems. Human insecurity within this post-crisis context consists of the denial of human rights among sections of the population and deliberate destruction of households. Human security is relevant in this regard because it identifies policy measures in tackling some of the issues experienced by the population. He explains the human security approach referring to Amartya Sen and Sadaka Ogata, the link between human rights and human development and the focus on people rather than state. Human security seeks to secure people from a broad range of threats.

Swat has been a deliberate and interesting choice for our NFR project, since it has had a downward slide. The area was doing well before 1969 when it merged with Pakistan, and it used to be a secular state although people were Muslims. But during the conflict from 2007-2009 the violence and perpetrations escalated and it was hard to reconcile. He explained that it was pretty tough to do research in this area because of the many military check points and threats from Taliban.

With the human security background in mind he continued presenting the post-crisis development and the involvement of humanitarian and development actors trying to address the problems caused by conflict and floods. He has tried to connect the policies on this together with the experiences from the ground. There has been an emphasis on relief, rather than long-term development for the local population. Lots of resources have been used, but they have not been used efficiently enough. The constant focus on relief has developed into a 'dependency syndrome'. There are also long-term development initiatives within the policies, but they have not been translated into practice. The international

community has not supported this, apart from the multilateral organizations such as the World Bank and Asian Development Bank which have tried to come up with initiatives. When long-term rehabilitation and reconstruction support has been done it has started too late. Obstacles for local development are also related to the fact that the military has the main authority. There has generally been a mismatch between shifting the focus from the short-term needs to the long-term needs in terms of strengthening livelihoods and improving infrastructure within the district.

In the end of his session he included some reflections on the gendered dimensions that are generally missing in the policies, for example including the challenges in female-headed households. Gender-based programs are also missing. Although he did not initially focus on gender in his work, he has during the process of the NFR project understood the importance of applying gender to his research.

# Development Aid in Post-Crisis Swat: Local Perspectives – Saleem Ahmad, Executive Director, HUJRA (local NGO from Swat, Pakistan)

Saleem started presenting the locally-based organization HUJRA (Holistic Understanding for Justified Research and Action), which was established in 1997. The word *hujra* means a traditional social institution for collective decision-making. Further on, he introduced us to their vision, mission and priority sectors. HUJRA have several partners, including UN organizations that have been there before, during and after the conflict. In addition, they are partners with several other well-known international organizations. Swat is just one of the areas in which HUJRA is working. The area has a long history, and it used to be a popular tourist attraction. There has been a massive influx of refugees and IDPs in Swat and the July 2010 flood really hit the area. Geographically, Swat is consisting of a lower area, a mid area and a high elevation area, that have been affected differently by the conflict and the flood.

Development practices have been going on since before the conflict. What are the needs? The focus has been on resource management and good governance. The land issue is critical, whether there is state propriety or individual ownership. Community mobilization, rural community development and poverty reduction has been on the agenda. Development actors entered already in 1980s, and made use of an integrated development model. At that time NGOs were not recognized in the local community, and there was a perception that NGOs had vested interests as well. The NGOs have also faced problems in reaching women. HUJRA has done interventions before the conflict, faced challenges during the conflict and is now in the midst of a post-conflict scenario. Among the challenges are lack of trust, media's role, and access to the communities due to security restrictions.

Sustainability of the organizations is a big question mark. The future role of local NGOs should include a focus on sustainable development, and they should influence policies and fill in the gaps where governments do not reach.

#### Discussion led by Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric

After the first sessions on conceptual framework and experiences from Pakistan, Shan introduced a discussion on the issues raised. He mentioned the securitization discourse, associated with the Copenhagen School. The issue was raised regarding the justification of breaking rules or norms as it is could be necessary to break norms/rules when it comes to changing gender relations and roles. He referred to Lene Hansen that is criticizing the Copenhagen School for neglecting the gender aspect of security. In her writings on honor killings in Pakistan she highlights the structural dimensions as well as the collective aspect of security.

The distinction between state security and human security derives from the human security concept introduced in the Human Development Report influenced by Amartya Sen's capability approach. He raised the question on what will guarantee and protect human security. There is a need to look at the role of the state and how the state protects the people. Legitimacy of the state plays a great role in this regard.

The meanings of development are many and it is necessary to dig deeper into the notion of the term. Having this in mind one needs to be critical to external support, since the agencies of the people may become subordinated. Although state is regarded as a provider of social security, this responsibility is often transferred to NGOs. As in Swat, the NGOs gained legitimacy and trust among the population during the post-crisis period. However, this may develop into a 'dependency syndrome', which is the way the people may define the problem. Moving from relief to development is not a linear process. NGOs should be more self-critical, also because they are influencing people's ideas. He referred to Duffield, who writes about the 'surplus population', in which among them there are development aid recipients. An advantage of this ongoing project in Pakistan is that it brings NGOs and researchers together.

After the introduction to the discussion comments were raised amongst the audience. The first issue was the dominance of humanitarian aid, the lack of awareness of the local context and how security issues make it difficult for donors to reach people on the ground. It was argued that the dependency syndrome is associated with the humanitarian stage. From the government side a strong coordination mechanism is needed. The two disasters did also happen simultaneously. In this regard there is a need to revise the strategy to move towards development. Another participant argued that one of the main problems is the shortage of resources, and that more resources should be allocated to long-term

development. The discussion then continued on the issue of dependency. Dependency is not only between the people and local NGOs, but also between local NGOs and donors/governments. The importance of looking at the aspect of power between the different actors (government, donors, NGOs and communities) was highlighted. When all motives and aims are implemented from outside, local NGOs often end up being just implementers of others decisions. In the discussion the situation were state security precedes human security was raised. Governments are selective and restrictive when it comes to NGOs working in certain areas - hence the NGOs degrees of freedom are reduced. Donors have accepted these conditions, while they are still committed to human rights and democracy. It was followed up by stating that the Pakistani government itself is a party, and the case is sometimes not properly presented to the international community. When priorities are shifting from area to area it does also affect the aid effectiveness. The issue of states legitimacy was raised in regard to the civil society. The civil society is not able to exercise their agency and this will further reduce the states legitimacy. A question was raised about whether there were parallel civil society actors to HUJRA, and if they were dependent on foreign funding. The answer was that some religious based civil society organizations are not depending on foreign funding.

# Gender Dimensions of Human Security and Post-Disaster Development in North Western Pakistan – Bahadar Nawab and Faheema Kalsoom (COMSATS University, Abbottabad, Pakistan)

Nawab introduced the session looking at Swat in a historical perspective from 1947 to 2012. Human security was then included in this perspective focusing on periods of militancy, IDPs and army operation, flood, relief and rehabilitation as well as future security and development. Taliban took part in relief emergency work after the earthquake and gained some trust from the local community. During the army operation, the local people were confused about who were fighting with whom. Today there is still insecurity among the population, because nobody knows if people will be killed or kidnapped. The army is currently looking for people who supported the militancy. Periods of relief, rehabilitation and development have occurred in the middle of many disasters. Many sectors have been damaged. There are some major beneficiaries of relief and rehabilitation, but there are also some major losers. During this period of human (in) security it has been a shift in the security paradigm. The police have become more visible, and the number of police stations has increased. There are power struggles among forces and politicians. Fears, revenge and uncertainty prevail.

Faheema continued the session focusing on women's experiences of conflict displacement and flood. Regarding education during and after militancy, girls were experiencing threats from Taliban when going to school, and they feared kidnapping. Schools were destroyed completely, teachers were threatened and girls were not allowed to go to school. After the Taliban period some girls did never go back to schools. Private hospitals are not accessible for the poor, and there is a lack of qualified staff at local level. Health problems are related to various diseases, unsafe drinking water, and poor sanitation systems, but the water and sanitation systems in Swat are being improved. As a result of conflict, health problems such as trauma, depression, high blood pressure, miscarriage and premature baby births exist. Among the security issues are threats of kidnapping, murder, and forced marriage. During the conflict women were restricted to their homes, while Taliban used to enter homes at night, stealing and raping.

She then moved on presenting the different experiences among women from different classes. In her data collection she found that the middle and poor class women are feeling more secure, while the rich women still have fear since they were mostly affected during militancy. Most of the people from rich class migrated before the displacement. The flood did also create problems for them, since it badly affected the economy. Medium class women were also targeted during militancy through, i.e. through target killings. Children did suffer from firing and blasts. The poor class women experienced loss of husbands or husbands that became disabled, that again led to lack of food security, badly disturbed livelihoods, restrictions of movement that made it difficult to go out and earn money, long distances in order to get food during displacement. She further discussed the class aspect of the situation as on of the trends during periods of disaster was that rich women turned into middle class women and middle class women turned into poor women. While the women and children were mostly affected during displacement, the men were mostly affected during conflict period. Today, women are trying to learn new and different skills. Perceptions of NGOs have changed, and there is more awareness about women's rights. In the end she stressed that there is great diversity among the answers, and it is challenging to come up with solutions. During her session she also presented life histories from women she had talked to in the field.

#### Discussion led by Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric

The discussion started with reflections from last session with the conclusion that the militants mainly targeted the rich class, but in terms of gender, women from all classes were targeted. Taliban wanted to take over people's property with the idea of distributing it to the whole population. They actually managed to get a lot of money from the rich people. Classes were moving downhill, from rich to middle, middle to poor and from poor to poorer. Women are still not allowed to leave their homes. It was argued that it is mainly men who are becoming aware of women's rights and are willing to protect them.

There are no big political changes in terms of leadership. The army is not considered neutral among the population. Many things are influencing the local community from the provincial to the national level. It was argued that it did not look like a new leadership was emerging. Nevertheless, mobilization is going on within the civil society. FM radio has been used to mobilize the people. Women's rights, such as women's ownership are on the agenda while at the same time some are also opposing women's access to education. Women leadership was emerging already before the conflict, during the conflict it decreased, but now it is growing again.

It was questioned if there were reasons to be optimistic about the future when development has not moved beyond relief so far. In that regard, the priority of the government is the main issue. Politicians are trying to be optimistic referring to big investments. Time is needed. It takes time to build up the soil after flood destructions. Opportunities have come with the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, which is focusing on the provincial level, but will it make a change? The question is whether the current leadership of the government lacks the vision to prioritize. A future development plan has been developed, but will the plan lead to action?

Another question from the audience was related to the rich forest resources in the area and whether the elite control that led to grievances during the militancy had impact on the forest resources. The answer was that forest degradation is continuously going on, but development actors are mostly focusing on humanitarian issues, and not so much on forest issues.

# Gender, Human Security and Development: Reflections from South Sudan – Darley Kjosavik

Darley introduced her session by saying that she hope this workshop will stimulate a discussion on gender, human security and development. The aim of the project is to contextualize return and livelihood in localities in South Sudan.

South-Sudan is currently facing return migration from neighbor countries and IDPs in the same area. Many IDPs do not want to go back to their places of origin. Conflicts over land use, land rights and land allocations have been more widespread and intensified. Resource conflicts are taking place between IDPs and local communities. Ethnic conflicts are happening between IDPs and locals belonging to different ethnic groups. Customary land institutions and territories governed by them are ethnicity based. The roles of local institutions are being mediated but perhaps not redefined by the agencies set up by the South Sudan government to deal with land issues.

Studies have been conducted in the Eastern Equatoria state in South Sudan, and the county Maguri was purposely chosen because it has experienced displacement and large-scale migration to Uganda. The refugees spent many years in Uganda before they returned. The same area has many IDPs from other war-affected areas in South Sudan. Conflict has occurred between herders and farmers in this county. When the refugees returned the resource conflicts escalated.

The gendered nature of the process poses special challenges regarding women and livelihood. Studies have been conducted on women and livelihood in Nimule, and most of the female respondents were divorced or widows. Most women mentioned polygamy as an oppressive institution. Among the security issues include no progress in terms of demobilization of the army, men carrying guns on the street, thieves breaking into stores, and sexual assault and rape during food collection. The security issues have consequences for mobility and ability to construct their livelihoods. However, women are making efforts regarding livelihood revival and reintegration. This study has concentrated on a self-organized group of 36 Tandupasi women. The majority of the women are from female-headed households. These women organized the group in a refugee camp in Uganda assisted by UNHCR, and continued when they came back. They drew inspiration from women's groups in Uganda.

There is need for renegotiation the right to land, but the activists are not pushing rights on the agenda. Land grabbing is taking place in South Sudan although the right to land is there. Among the concluding remarks were that the reintegration concept needs to take into account the gender dimensions. Livelihoods and security challenges faced by women are interlinked. There is also a need for inclusive conceptualizations of human security that are sensitive to gendered dimensions.

#### Discussion led by Stig Hansen, Noragric

The discussion was introduced by the argument that post-conflict is a contested concept in South Sudan, since there is currently a fear for intra-state war. A focus within the study in the newly established country has been resettlement, reintegration and land rights. It was stated that customary rights are often ethnicity based. The Land Act from 2009 recognizes customary rights, but it doesn't recognize ethnic divisions. Although South Sudan and North Sudan is separated, there are still conflicts within South Sudan. There is need for women's land rights to be renegotiated. The intersection of ethnic identity and gendered identity should be recognized. It was also argued that there is need for renegotiation of gender relations on several fronts, not only regarding land. For instance, the justice system, in which gender has a huge dimension, should be renegotiated. There is a dynamic in multiple negotiations, such as increased income among women might lead to other negotiations concerning women. The integration of livelihoods and human security was

also highlighted. One of participants asked how one can bring about changes in terms of gender negotiations, and who is going to influence. The issue was raised on how research could be made more relevant for policymakers. It was said that the aim was to gain knowledge of the experiences from the communities, and women and their situation in particular. It was also highlighted that state builders and policy makers can insights from this study.

## Current and Future Research Directions – Ingvild Jacobsen, Abda Khalid, Noor Elahi, Darley Kjosavik, Ingrid Nyborg, Noragric

Ingvild started the session presenting her ongoing research on women and security – a qualitative study of women's experiences of conflict and post-conflict in Swat, Pakistan. The focus of her study is on women's experiences and perceptions of health, education, legal rights, mobility and social support. Gender power relations and gender roles are crucial concepts, and the complexity between security, gender and development will be studied. The research area and fieldwork is taking place in Swat district. The research objective is to gain knowledge and understanding of women's experiences and perceptions. The theoretical framework is based on feminist security studies, including critique of security and development discourses for neglecting gender. Qualitative methodology is chosen as a way to approach the research, and semi-structured interviewing as the research method. The way forward is to do more field work when access, and fill in the gaps. There will be presentations of findings in conferences and workshops. The plan is also to extend the research to Afghanistan.

Abda continued the session presenting her upcoming research exploring class relationships in perspective of conflict, gender ties and impact of post-disaster in Swat. The purpose of the research is to investigate how militant groups play their cards on relationships between classes. She is going to look at the concept of class relationship in pre-and post-crisis Swat. Important for this research is to look at the transitions and changes in class relations and gender roles in this area. Another focus will be on the impact of humanitarian aid agencies and government recovery policies on class relationships, gender and societal well-being.

Noor moved on presenting his upcoming research understanding social and cultural aspects of gendered relations in livelihoods. In this research, gender is perceived as socially constructed, including both men and women. The research area will be rural Swat. The purpose of the study is to investigate the changes in traditional roles and relationships of men and women and the social and cultural relationships of men and women in livelihood. Among the research objectives are the identification of class-based gender-specific needs

and issues. Critical theory approach is the theoretical framework that will be used. The methodology is anthropological, based on ethnographic findings. The Pukthoon culture is at the core of his research, and it is different from many other cultures in Pakistan.

Further, Darley continued talking about the future plans regarding the research in South-Sudan. The plan is to interview men as well, and in different contexts. Ingrid presented the follow-up plan for the research in Pakistan, in which the idea is to link up with similar experiences from Afghanistan. Common for both countries is that there has been too little focus on the police, since the military dominates on the agenda. Rozan is an organization in Pakistan that is training police in gender and human rights. The organization is in dialogue with the partners in this project. Rozan is designing curricula at every level in the police training. A small study has now been approved by the Norwegian embassy in Pakistan. The main objectives are to investigate the challenges of policing in post-conflict situation in Swat looking at the community aspect.

# Summing up and closing led by Nadarajah Shanmugaratnam, Noragric

At the end of the workshop Shan gave a summary of the day. Contested terms such as securitization, human security and state security are all relevant in this research. Human security is one of the organizing concepts of the research in Pakistan and South- Sudan, but there is still need for a good working definition of human security. Feminist security studies are important to include because of the gender focus. Class, gender and ideology are all key terms that are addressed in the PhD projects. There are challenges in both South Sudan, being a new state, and Pakistan with its regional ties with India. Pakistan is a state that is oriented towards national security with the military as a powerful institution and in the midst of a geopolitical situation. The strength of the institute of Noragric is that it is focused on local level research although it is seen in a larger global context; hence the micro-macro link is important.

After the summing up, the floor was opened up for questions and comments from the participants. The issue of dissemination of the research to the local people was raised. It was stressed that knowledge development is important. Another one mentioned that they are in close cooperation with the embassy in Pakistan. One of the strengths to Noragric is that the staff is good at making publications, but there is also need to work towards broader dissemination of research and to make contributions to better policymaking. This was also highlighted by the representative from the Norwegian Research Council, who appreciated both the presentations and the discussion, and was looking forward to the results as the research progressed.



Photo: Helena Svele. Workshop participants.